

Topics that I will not cover

- Unconscious Bias
- Stereotype Threat
- Tokenism
- Glass Cliff


## Today's Topics

- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- The Problem \& Solution: Leaders' Impact
- Practical tools:

Celebration of Success Critical Period Support

- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- Leaders' Impact
- Celebration of Success
- Critical Period Support


Team-Authored Work More Highly Cited Than Solo-Authored Work


Wuchty, et al. Science 2007;316:1036-1039


## Evidence for a Collective Intelligence Factor in the Performance of Human Groups

```
Anita Williams Woolley,,* Christopher F. Chabris, ',3 Alex Pentland,}\mp@subsup{}{}{3,4
Nada Hashmi,}\mp@subsup{}{}{3,5}\mathrm{ Thomas W. Malone }\mp@subsup{}{}{3,5
Psychologists have repeatedly shown that a single statistical factor-often called "general
intelligence"-emerges from the correlations among people's performance on a wide variety of cognitive
tasks. But no one has systematically examined whether a similar kind of "collective intelligence exists for
grops of of a general collective intelligence factor that explains a group's performance on a wide variety
of tasks.This "c factor" is not strongly correlated with the average or maximum individual intelligence
of grous. mers but is crroted with the avorae social sensitvity of aroup members the equalitve
distribution of conversational turn-taking, and the proportion of females in the group.
distribution of conversational turn-taking, and the proportion of females in the group.
    29 OCTOBER 2010 VOL 330 SCIENCE
    Carnegie-Mellon, MIT
```


## Group's Collective Intelligence

1. Moderately correlated with average intelligence of individual group members
and the intelligence of the highestscoring team member.
2. Not correlated with group cohesion, motivation, and satisfaction.

## Group's Collective Intelligence

3. Significant correlation
with the average social sensitivity of group members.

Groups where a more equal distribution of conversational turn-taking scored more collectively intelligent than those in which a few people dominated the conversation.

Woolley et al, Science 330, 2010

## Group's Collective Intelligence

4. collective intelligence was positively and significantly correlated with the proportion of women in the group.

They scored better on the social sensitivity measure than men (taking turns).

## Additional Benefits of Diversity

5. Direct contribution of diverse perspectives by women and underrepresented
6. Stimulates others (more traditionally included) individuals to think in different ways
"Unconscious Bias at Work" Brian Welle (Google Ventures) https://www.gv.com/lib/unconscious-bias-at-work

## Potential Gender Bias in

 Team Effort Evaluation- Women receive less credit if rating is "team-based".
- Women get due credit if individual contributions are rated.
"No Credit Where Credit Is Due: Attributional Rationalization of Women's Success in Male-Female Teams." Heilman \& Haynes J.Appl.Psych. 90:905-16, 2005
- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- The Problem \& Solution: Leaders' Impact
- Practical tools:

Celebration of Success
Critical Period Support

Climate Perceptions Differ by
Faculty Gender



Advance Survey, $\mathrm{N}=816$; Includes combined responses of strongly agree and somewhat agree; *Items significantly different by gender, $\mathrm{p} \leq .05$

Diana Bilimoria, IWiN 9-23-2010

The Impact of Committed Leaders
Leaders have a disproportionate impact on organizations because of their status as authorities

1) establish and publicize policies to increase fairness,
2) legitimize and support the leadership of both women \& men.
"Why So Slow? The Advancement of Women". Virginia Valian, MIT Press, 1999

## MIT's Problems (1996)

- Unequal resources/rewards to senior women faculty
- Family-work conflict for junior women faculty
- Small number of women faculty
- No women faculty in academic administration
- Undervaluation of equal accomplishment
- Marginalization of women faculty as they rise

Nancy Hopkins, MIT

## MIT (2010)

- MIT President, 3 of 5 Deans are women, 2 of 6 department chairs in science and 1 in engineering are women.
- Numbers of women faculty in science and engineering have more than doubled.
- Having children is discussed openly, and women have actually taken maternity leaves and gotten tenure - for the first time in MIT's history
- New day care center in one of the most prominent and heavily trafficked places at MIT. (Second new day care center opened in 2013.)
- MIT is not alone: other universities have achieved similar results, In some cases these changes were initiated through NSF ADVANCE grants


## Impact of Department Chairs

- Individuals experience climate in their immediate workplace-department, division.
- Chair's perspectives of climate differs from those of other faculty, especially women faculty

Study of Faculty Work-life at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2003

## Chairs \& Women Faculty <br> Differ in Perception of Climate



* Significant $t$-test between women and men faculty at $p<.05$ $\gamma$ Significant - -test between dept. chairs and all other faculty at $p<.05$.

WISELI: Enhancing Departmental Climate

## Impact of Department Chairs

- Individuals experience climate in their immediate workplace -department, division.
- Chair's perspectives of climate differs from those of other faculty, especially women faculty
- Chairs can significantly influence women's experiences in their departments

Study of Faculty Work-life at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2003

```
            Impact of a Leader
    Chairman of Medicine, John Stobo, MD
    Johns Hopkins Medical School - 1990 (Emma Stokes, consultant)
    -Women faculty earned less than men and advanced more
        slowly.
    - Appointed a committee to evaluate situation
        and develop ways to deal with gender-based problems.
    Committee found
    -Women were coming up for promotion later than men
        because evaluators failed to identify qualified women.
    e.g., junior men faculty were asked to chair confs 6X more
        frequently than junior women faculty.
    -Women didn't know the criteria for promotion.
```

"Career Developen for women in academic medicie: Mulint ind
"Career Development for women in academic cedicine: Multiple interventions
medicine." Fried et al JAMA 1996; 276:898. (Emma Stokes and Linda Fried)

Dr. Stobo's initiatives included:

- Annual faculty evaluations with explicit info re progress.
- Monthly meetings with concrete mentoring for moving up in career.
- Senior faculty were given explicit info on how to mentor.
- Important meetings moved from outside normal hrs.

Dr. Stobo's initiatives included:

- Annual faculty evaluations with explicit info re progress.
- Monthly meetings with concrete mentoring for moving up in career.
- Senior faculty were given explicit info on how to mentor.
- Important meetings moved from outside normal hrs.

Impact on the Dept of Medicine -1990 there were 6 women Assoc Profs
-1995 there were 26 women Assoc Profs.

To Overcome Unconscious Bias*

- Collect data
-Evidence that something is wrong - state metrics
- Establish structure for success
-Criteria that are essential - ignore all else
- Evaluate subtle messages -Microaggressions driven by unconscious bias (DWEGs)
- Hold everyone accountable
-Think and than act (rather than react - unconscious bias) - Justify in writing
- Make decisions collectively - After discussion by diverse committee
* Google Ventures, Unconscious Bias at Work https://www.gv.com/lib/ * University of Michigan, STRIDE http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance/stride committee


## Chairs Have a Huge Impact

- Improve departmental stability
- Increase faculty \& student productivity
- Recruit \& retain faculty and students
- Promote respect, collegiality, inclusion, collaboration, and cooperation in department
- Expose \& correct unconscious bias
- Improve the delivery of medicine and science
hisholm-Burns, Richardson \& Rodrigues, University of Arizona ADVANCE Program
- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- The Problem \& Solution:

Leaders' Impact

- Practical tools:

Celebration of Success
Critical Period Support


- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- The Problem \& Solution: Leaders' Impact
- Practical tools:

Celebration of Success
Critical Period Support

|  | - 26 accomplished women <br> faculty - physicians and <br> scientists |
| :--- | :--- |
| - Diverse ages, background and |  |
| cultures |  |

## Just Desserts Program <br> Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai

- Goal: Platform for highly successful women physicians \& scientists as role models \& mentors for women trainees and faculty
- Monthly meeting in informal setting
- Features the story of unique path of a highly successful woman scientist and/or physician
- Sharing information about success in juggling competing responsibilities of career, family, and outside interests, overcoming bias
- Chocolate and fruit are served
"Building Groups to Help Women Survive and Succeed." ASCB Newsletter, October 2014


## Women Speakers for Seminars, Grand Rounds, Symposia

Two very different examples in Bioengineering:

- MSSM Annual Imaging Symposium:

1 woman and 24 men (five years)

- Stanford BioX Symposium 2014: Mechanobiology 5 speakers - all women
- Increasing Dominance of Teams and Importance of Diversity
- The Problem \& Solution:

Leaders' Impact

- Practical tools:

Celebration of Success
Critical Period Support

## Celebration of Success: Grand Rounds Speakers

- You could follow Grand Rounds with a Just Desserts event

How many women speakers this year at your Grand Rounds?

Women Speakers for Seminars, Grand Rounds, Symposia - resources

WICB Speakers Referral List
http://ascb.org/wicb-committee/
downloadable list and/or customized list
Synberc
http://www.synberc.org/speaker-diversity
provides names of suggested women speakers and sample letter to organizers to encourage gender balance
[Synberc organizers: Pamela Silver, George Church (Harvard)
Kristala Jones Prather, Natalie Kuldell, Ken Oye, Christopher Voigt, Ron Weiss (MIT)]

## Claflin Distinguished Scholar Awards

- Advancement of junior women scientists to senior faculty positions is still far less frequent than that of their male counterparts at MGH
- Significant obstacle to career advancement is the difficulty of maintaining research productivity during the child-rearing years
- Provide bridge funding for junior faculty to sustain research productivity during the child-rearing years
- Funds may be used for support of a technician, postdoctoral fellow or graduate student and supplies.
http://www2.massgeneral.org/facultydevelopment/owc/claflin.html
-Three-page basic or clinical research plan
- MD, PhD, within 7 years of first full-time faculty appointment
- Primary appointment and conducting their research at MGH
- Salary support from a grant or other funding source
- Applicant is clearly the Pl , whose academic progress would benefit from such funding support
- Evidence of strong research training, productivity, and a welldefined focus in either basic or clinical research
- Responsible for care of children
- $\$ 50,000 / \mathrm{yr} \times 2$ in 2014 in direct costs, plus $15 \%$ indirect costs per year.



## Stanford ABCC* Program - Work-Life Integration

Career customization plan (3-5 yr period):
Pace to promotion
Disaggregated workload
Role as contributor or leader
Schedule predictability
Work-life integration
Organized as teams -meeting clinicians' administrative responsibilities
Basic scientists - tradeoff teaching and service with others.
Faculty earn credits for taking on these responsibilities when they can
*Academic Biomedical Career Customization based on Deloitte's Mass Career ustomization model for flexibility

Valantine \& Sandborg. Acad Med 2013;88:1411-1413.
supported by Dean and a Grant from the Sloan Foundation

## Stanford ABCC* Program

Faculty bank earned credits
Trade credits for time for high-priority work-related tasks or for time for home and family responsibilities.
"Banking system" rewards individual faculty for taking on the shared responsibilities of the group, thereby providing concrete benefits to alleviate worklife and work-work conflict when needed.

Exchange Banked Credits for:
Work: targeted coaching, editing and PowerPoint design support services.
Home: housecleaning and meals delivered at home, outsourcing errands,

```
        Key Programs and Benefits for Faculty with Family Responsibilities Stanford University
- Child Care Resources and Referrals (7 on-site childcare centers; waiting lists)
- Child Care Subsidy Grant Program (children 9 y.o. and younger; up to \(\$ 5 \mathrm{~K}\) based on application including income information)
- Faculty Child Care Assistance Program (children 5 y.o. and younger; salary supplement to eligible faculty to offset child care expenses; \(\$ 5-20 \mathrm{~K}\) based on adjusted family income)
- Dependent Day Care Flexible Spending Account (before tax \$, reimbursement of work-related dependent day care if incurred)
- Adoption Reimbursement Program (\$10K)
ParentNet \& SeniorNet - email lists
- School-Age Resources \& Elder Care Resources
```

```
            Key Programs and Benefits
        for Faculty with Family Responsibilities
    - Faculty Back-Up Care Advantage Programs
        Kids (10 days/yr; co-pay $15/day in center, $6/hr at home)
        \bulletElders (10 days/yr; $6/hr co-pay)
- Junior Faculty Dependent Care Travel Grants (untenured Jr faculty up to \(\$ 1 \mathrm{~K}\) post-tax/yr)
- New Parent Tenure Clock Extension
- Reduced Teaching or Clinical Load (during quarter of childbirth, full pay)
- Part-Time Appointments (for family related needs)
- Dual Career Assistance (finding positions in Bay area or Stanford)
- Counseling Support (on both personal and workplace issues, for faculty members and family; free 10 sessions/issue)

\section*{Helping Women Succeed in Academic Biomedicine}
- High impact work is now done by teams. Women scientists and physicians are an essential part of the team.
- Informed, committed leadership is essential.
- Celebrate success and provide support and alternative pathways.
- Overcome unconscious bias.
- Provide support at critical times for Jr faculty.
- Change the climate and enhance the success of your faculty and department
```

            Helping Women Succeed in
            Academic Biomedicine
    - High impact work is now done by teams
Women scientists and physicians are an essential part of
the team
    - Informed, committed leadership is essential
    - Celebrate success and provide alternative pathways
    - Overcome unconscious bias
    - Provide support at critical times for Jr faculty

```
    Change the climate and enhance the success
        of your faculty and department

\title{
Advancing Women in Academic Biomedicine
}

Sandra K. Masur April 2015
References

\section*{Impactful science and team diversity}
1. "The Increasing Dominance of Teams in Production of Knowledge."

Wuchty et al, Science 316:1036-1039, 2007
2. "The Difference: How the Power of Diversity Creates Better Groups, Firms, Schools, and Societies", S.E.Page. Princeton University Press. 2008
3. "Evidence for a Collective Intelligence Factor in the Performance of Human Groups" Woolley et al, Science 2010, 330 Published Online 30 Sept 2010
4. "No Credit Where Credit Is Due: Attributional Rationalization of Women's Success in Male-Female Teams." Heilman \& Haynes J.Appl.Psych. 90:905-16, 2005
5. "Unconscious Bias at Work" Brian Welle (Google Ventures) https://www.gv.com/lib/unconscious-bias-at-work

\section*{Bibliography related to women in science and academia}
1. "Why So Slow? The Advancement of Women." Virginia Valian. The MIT Press. 1999
2. "Has Feminism Changed Science?" Londa Schiebinger. Harvard University Press. 1999
3. "Women in cell biology: a seat at the table and a place at the podium." Sandra K. Masur Mol Biol.Cell 2013 Jan;24(2):57-60.
4. "What Works for Women at Work" Joan C. Williams and Rachel Dempsey. NYU Press. 2014
5. "7 Actionable Seven Actionable Strategies for Advancing Women in Science, Engineering, and Medicine" Kirsten Smith et al. Cell Stem Cell 16: 221-224, March 5, 2015
6. "Every Other Thursday: Stories and Strategies from Successful Women Scientists" Ellen Daniell. Yale University Press. 2008
7. "Changing the Culture of Academic Medicine to Eliminate the Gender Leadership Gap: 50/50 by 2020" Valantine \& Sandborg. Acad Med 2013;88:1411-1413.

\section*{Women in Cell Biology of the American Society for Cell Biology (downloadable)}
1. Monthly WICB career strategy columns http://ascb.org/wicbcareer-strategy-column/ http://www.ascb.org/other-publications/other-publications.html
2. Speakers Referral List http://ascb.org/wicb-committee/

\section*{Websites of potential interest and helpful information}
1. ADVANCE: Increasing the Participation and Advancement of Women in Academic Science and Engineering Careers http://www.nsf.gov/funding/pgm_summ.jsp?pims_id=5383
Institutional Transformational Awards (2 page summaries with urls for Best Practices):
https://www.nsf.gov/crssprgm/advance/advance_Two-Page_Summaries_2007.pdf
e.g. U Michigan ADVANCE (STRIDE) http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance/stride_committee
2. NIH Updates on Women in Science (NUWS) http://womeninscience.nih.gov
3. The National Library of Medicine's "Changing the Face of Medicine" exhibition: Celebrating America's Women Physicians: is an exhibition that honors the lives and achievements of women in medicine. \(\mathrm{http}: / / w w w . n l m . n i h . g o v / c h a n g i n g t h e f a c e o f m e d i c i n e / e x h i b i t i o n / ~\)
4. Synberc: http://www.synberc.org/speaker-diversity
sandra.masur@mssm.edu
Sandra K. Masur, PhD., Chair, Women in Cell Biology of the American Society for Cell Biology Director, Office for Women's Careers and Professor, Ophthalmology,
Icahn School of Medicine at Mount Sinai, NYC```

